Use of Artificial Intelligence in Credential Evaluation: A Principled Approach

Prepared by: Association of International Credential Evaluators (AICE)

November 2024

Use of Artificial Intelligence in Credential Evaluation: A Principled Approach

An artificial intelligence system (or "AI system") [AI] refers to a technological system that, using a model, makes inferences in order to generate output, including predictions, recommendations, or decisions[1]

As members learn about Artificial Intelligence (AI), some AICE members are already using AI systems and platforms for tasks related to evaluation, including writing, checking digital documents, researching educational institutions, programs of study, and background information on the development of educational systems.

At AICE, we trust and encourage our members to take a principled, informed approach in the use of this adaptive technology and any recommendations it may yield. All members need to protect the quality of evaluations they produce, as well as all those we serve with their evaluations.

Starting with the five Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD)'s values based Responsible AI Principles[2] – principles that have informed policy created in countries like the United States[3,4], Canada[5] and the European area[6] – AICE recommends international credential evaluators consider the recommendations that follow each principle as they move forward with including AI in their business processes related to evaluation.

1: Inclusive growth, sustainable development and well-being[7]
AI is trained on information that can be challenging to know details about, including where and when it was gathered, how much is used in the AI tool a member may interact with and so on. Because of this, members should assume that AI carries inherent non-neutrality, and they must manage it responsibly.

Members are ideally situated to ask and then challenge the outputs of AI: as subject matter experts, you will train AI for your own purposes but because the technology is global, you will

---

[1] Champagne, F.-P. (2023). Letter to Mr. Joël Lightbound, M.P. regarding proposed amendments to the Digital Charter Implementation Act, 2022. In *Letter*. https://www.ourcommons.ca/content/Committee/441/INDU/WebDoc/WD12751351/12751351/MinisterOfInnovationScienceAndIndustry-2023-11-28-Combined-e.pdf

[2] *OECD AI Policy Observatory Portal*. (n.d.). https://oecd.ai/en/ai-principles

[3] U.S. Department of Commerce, & National Institute of Standards and Technology. Raimondo, G.M., & Locascio, L.E., (2023). Artificial Intelligence Risk Management Framework (AIRMF 1.0)). In NIST AI 100-1 [Report]. https://nvlpubs.nist.gov/nistpubs/ai/NIST.AI.100-1.pdf

[4] United States of America, President Jospeh R. Biden (2023, October 2023). Executive Order on the safe, secure, and trustworthy development and use of artificial intelligence. https://www.whitehouse.gov/briefing-room/presidential-actions/2023/10/30/executive-order-on-the-safe-secure-and-trustworthy-development-and-use-of-artificial-intelligence/

[5] Canada, House of Commons, (Ottawa, 2023, April 24). Bill C-27, An Act to enact the Consumer Privacy Protection Act, the Personal Information and Data Protection Tribunal Act and the Artificial Intelligence and Data Act and to make consequential and related amendments to other Acts, 1st Sess, 44th Parl, 2021 (second reading April 24, 2023). https://www.parl.ca/legisinfo/en/bill/44-1/c-27

[6] Council of Europe. (2019, April 8). *Ethics guidelines for trustworthy AI*. Shaping Europe's Digital Future. https://digital-strategy.ec.europa.eu/en/library/ethics-guidelines-trustworthy-ai

[7] *Supra* Note 2.

also be helping the profession. This, then, helps people enhance their capabilities, promotes creativity, facilitates equity and access, fosters growth, well-being, civic engagement and sustainability.

2. Human rights and democratic values, including fairness and privacy[8]
Our members must continue to respect the law, human rights and democratic values while using AI. Particular attention to the broad spectrum of each aspect of humanity must be paid (freedom, dignity, equality, equity, difference/diversity, fairness and labour rights), so that when AI is used, it maintains these values.

3. Transparency and explainability[9]
Members should consider creating a statement on use of AI in their services, so their clients/applicants know that it is being used, and how and when it is being used. The right to challenge your assessment would remain whole.

Where possible, members should regularly vet the AI platforms they use to ensure they understand the information it was trained on and the limitations that may place on evaluations. This includes monitoring the development of AI as more complex thinking processes are taught to each AI tool.

4. Robustness, security and safety[10]
Members are encouraged to be selective and critical about the AI tools they use, ensuring they are as robust as possible, while maintaining the highest levels of security and safety, protecting client/applicant information. Any instances of faulty results should be noted and, if they persist, consideration of a new AI platform should be undertaken.

5. Accountability[11]
In our use of AI, we need to monitor for proper functioning, testing AI platforms regularly to ensure performance remains normative. For members with IT teams, we recommend regular checks for harmful bias (comparing its predictions to known information, for example), and the preservation of human rights (safety, security, and privacy). Each person interacting with an AI becomes a developer by proxy and should act according to the role designated by their employer, including the context in which they work.

For the international credential evaluation industry, AI is a new space, with unpredictable developments and new capabilities arising almost daily. As professionals in the field, we will continue to produce our best work, while – with cautious optimism – interacting with a new technology. AICE members remain committed to maintaining the AICE standards while embracing new technology responsibly.

---

[8] *Supra* Note 2.
[9] *Supra* Note 2.
[10] *Supra* Note 2.
[11] *Supra* Note 2.

References

Canada, House of Commons, (Ottawa, 2023, April 24). *Bill C-27, An Act to enact the Consumer Privacy Protection Act, the Personal Information and Data Protection Tribunal Act and the Artificial Intelligence and Data Act and to make consequential and related amendments to other Acts*, 1st Sess, 44th Parl, 2021 (second reading April 24, 2023). https://www.parl.ca/legisinfo/en/bill/44-1/c-27

Champagne, F.-P. (2023). Letter to Mr. Joël Lightbound, M.P. regarding proposed amendments to the Digital Charter Implementation Act, 2022. In *Letter*. https://www.ourcommons.ca/content/Committee/441/INDU/WebDoc/WD12751351/12751351/MinisterOfInnovationScienceAndIndustry-2023-11-28-Combined-e.pdf

Council of Europe. (2019, April 8). *Ethics guidelines for trustworthy AI*. Shaping Europe's Digital Future. https://digital-strategy.ec.europa.eu/en/library/ethics-guidelines-trustworthy-ai

Higher Education Strategy Associates AI Observatory (n.d.) https://higheredstrategy.com/ai-observatory-home/ai-observatory-policies-and-guidelines/.
- Policy development in higher education in Canada and globally for AI

Lantero, L., Feranti, L. Fioncchietti, C., et al. (2023, November). *Artificial intelligence and recognition of qualifications: Opportunities and risks from an ENIC-NARIC perspective.* CIMEA Association. https://www.cimea.it/Upload/Documenti/Artificial_Intelligence_and_Recognition_of_Qualifications.pdf

OECD AI Policy Observatory Portal. (n.d.). https://oecd.ai/en/ai-principles

U.S. Department of Commerce, & National Institute of Standards and Technology. Raimondo, G.M., & Locascio, L.E., (2023). Artificial Intelligence Risk Management Framework (AIRMF 1.0)). In NIST AI 100-1 [Report]. https://nvlpubs.nist.gov/nistpubs/ai/NIST.AI.100-1.pdf

United States of America, President Jospeh R. Biden (2023, October 2023). *Executive Order on the safe, secure, and trustworthy development and use of artificial intelligence.* https://www.whitehouse.gov/briefing-room/presidential-actions/2023/10/30/executive-order-on-the-safe-secure-and-trustworthy-development-and-use-of-artificial-intelligence/